Discussion of
“Commodity Prices, Growth and Productivity: A Sectoral View”
by
Claudia De la Huerta and Javier García-Cicco

Christiane Baumeister
University of Notre Dame

Closing Conference of the BIS CCA Research Network on
“The commodity cycle: macroeconomic and financial stability implications”
August 18-19, 2016
Bigger Picture

• Dutch disease
  ➢ After a commodity boom, some segments of the economy of commodity exporters become less competitive in the global market which results in a contraction in those sectors and a lack of TFP progress
  ➢ Depletion of resources may eventually limit growth unless TFP results in more efficient use of resources

• While the mechanism of this phenomenon is well understood, empirical evidence for its relevance is mixed.
What Does the Paper Do?

- Quantifies the effects of temporary and permanent copper price shocks on measures of productivity and growth.
- Exploits the heterogeneity of sectoral responses to assess the relevance of Dutch-disease concerns for Chile.
- Decomposes the estimated effect on TFP into a reallocation component and “true” productivity changes.
- Finds that manufacturing output increases, but TFP declines after a shock that raises copper prices.
TFP Measures

• Previous studies have computed sectoral TFP measures for Chile
  ➢ What are the differences in methodology?
  ➢ How much do the constructed measures differ from previous approaches?
  ➢ How sensitive are the results to alternative measures of TFP?
TFP Measures

- Off-the-shelf measure for aggregate TFP for Chile from Feenstra, Inklaar and Timmer, “The Next Generation of the Penn World Table” (AER 2015)
TFP Measures

• For some of the components in the computation of TFP, the authors use an HP filter for trend-cycle decomposition

• James Hamilton, “Why You Should Never Use the Hodrick-Prescott Filter”
  - HP-filtered series is a linear function of future variables that are not knowable at date $t$
  - Dynamics of resulting series primarily reflect the filter, not the true data-generating process
  - Maximum likelihood estimate of smoothing parameter $\lambda$ is typically much smaller than usual assumed values
  - This paper: HP assumes $\lambda = 6.25$, actual MLE = 0.6
    $\Rightarrow$ HP over smooths by order of magnitude
Energy Consumption Data

Cyclical component

HAMILTON_CYCLE
HP_CYCLE

Shares of Nominal GDP: Units?

Figure 5: Shares of nominal GDP (as a percentage of GDP excluding Mining and Utilities)
World Price of Copper

- Break in 2005? ➞ Comparison with real oil price
World Price of Copper

• Structural break in 2005:
  ➢ Why would the break be deterministic?
  ➢ What’s the economic story behind the break?
  ➢ Deterministic structural break tests are prone to rejecting when there are persistent transitory dynamics (Kilian and Ohanian, MD 2002) and the sample is small.
  ➢ If there were important breaks, then a linear model such as a VAR would not perform well in out-of-sample forecasting.

  ➢ Baumeister and Kilian (JBES 2012) show that VAR model produces accurate forecasts for real price of oil.
Global Demand for Copper

• Sources of copper price shock matter for economic consequences: separate price changes driven by global economic activity from price changes that are specific to the copper market

• Proxy: trade-weighted GDP of Chile’s trading partners
  ➢ Main trading partners: China, US, Brazil
  ➢ Why only trading partners? Why is this the relevant metric?
  ➢ Use more inclusive measure of global real economic activity

• Identification assumption: no response of trading partner’s GDP to global copper price shock within the quarter
Responses of International Variables to Temporary Copper Price Shock

\[ P^{Co*} \implies GDP^* \]

\[ P^{Co*} \implies P^{Co*} \]
Responses of International Variables to Temporary Copper Price Shock

- Both real copper prices and economic activity in Chile’s trading partners increase
  - Author’s explanation for positive effect: trading partners are also commodity exporters and thus experience stimulus just as Chile because commodity prices comove
  - BUT response of GDP in Chile is quite sluggish

- What happens after a shock to global activity to those two variables? Look similar? Shocks properly identified?
Sectoral Evidence

- Decline in mining sector GDP after both temporary and permanent increase in copper prices

Temporary shock

Permanent shock

- Where is the boom?
- Reverse causation?
- BUT: Why would other sectors benefit?
Sectoral Evidence for Canada

• Charnavoki and Dolado (AEJ Macro 2014)

Responses to a real commodity price shock

• What explains the difference?
Conclusion

• Interesting paper

• Sectoral approach very promising to better understand and interpret aggregate findings and to assess who wins and who loses

• Main challenges:
  ➢ Are the empirical results robust to changes in the data?
  ➢ Is the model well specified and identified?
  ➢ Can we draw general lessons for commodity-exporting countries or is Chile a special case?